

**Gender Equality, WEE and Social Inclusion in Market Systems and Value
Chains: Frameworks, Tools and Approaches with a Focus on Asia Pacific V.2
Deliverable One: (ACIAR), Project No. AGB/2018/121
Prepared by Emily Miller, Consultant
Submitted August 30, 2018**

Background:

A brief subject review and annotated bibliography incorporating key references and material related to gender equality, women's economic empowerment and social inclusion frameworks, approaches and tools in market systems and value chain research, with a focus on Asia Pacific was developed over July-August 2018 by Emily Miller. Ms Miller is a U.S. based consultant in international market development and gender/social inclusion the ACIAR project titled "Revision and Update of Markets for the Poor (M4P) and the Agribusiness Master Class curriculum". "A Toolkit for Practitioners of M4P Value Chain Analysis,V.3" was published by Agricultural Development International in December 2008. An updated and Indonesian translation of the book was published in 2012. Both publications were funded by the UK Department for International Development (DFID).

Since the last publication, research studies, guides, toolkits and programmes that aim to mainstream gender, and to a lesser extent social inclusion, in market systems development and value chains have increased markedly. The reasons for this are many but there is a global recognition of gender equality, women's empowerment and social inclusion of youth and minorities as significant factors in the success of agricultural market development, in terms of business performance and development impact. Women's critical roles in planting, tending and harvesting crops and edible marine life sustain the majority of families throughout the Asia Pacific region. Youth offer a great, largely untapped, human resource to the agricultural sector globally.

This review includes 27 references with the majority published since 2014. Below are highlights of the review followed by an annotated bibliography organized under 5 topics—global frameworks for gender and WEE in market system development; social inclusion, focus on South-East Asia, value chains and toolkits.

Frameworks for Gender Inclusion and Women's Economic Empowerment in Market System and Private Sector Development

[The Donor Committee for Enterprise Development \(DCED\)](#) and the [BEAM Exchange](#) have a strong market system approach, many good publications and provide the foundation for this annotated bibliography including frameworks for gender and Women's Economic Empowerment (WEE). In 2018 DCED updated its [Synthesis Document on integrating gender into a project cycle of a private sector development program](#) taking into account the degree of gender/WEE focus of the programme/intervention.

In 2016 the [Women's Empowerment and Market Systems \(WEAMS\) Framework](#) was introduced as a practical guide as an update of the earlier [WEE M4P Framework](#) developed by Linda Jones in 2012. In 2011 DFID introduced two important concepts—results chains and the DFID Business Case that have design implications for gender and social inclusion. Results chains needed to directly demonstrate the logic and linkages for economic benefits and higher incomes to poor households (with an emphasis on women) in market system development. The Business Case is designed at the programme inception phase and needs to demonstrate how and why the private sector can profit from gender and social

inclusion. Examples and guidance for articulating WEE within results chains, can be found in a [guide for practitioners was written by Erin Markel in 2014](#).

Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA), [“Tool: Integrating Women’s Economic Empowerment into M4P Approaches”](#), is four pages and is presented here for those practitioners who would like a clear yet brief overview of WEE and M4P. These sources may be used globally although programme and geographic specific case studies and examples are sometimes provided.

The DCED Synthesis Document cited above, found a gap in knowledge around the economic empowerment of adolescent girls. [“Review of Evaluation Approaches and Methods used by Interventions of Women’s and Girls’ Economic Empowerment,”](#) March 2014, is recommended in the context of developing a theory of change and addressing empowerment of adolescent girls.

The Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) offers an [Operational Guidance Note on Gender Equality and Women’s Economic Empowerment in Agriculture](#) (2015) to ensure that DFAT’s agriculture investments: do no harm to women and gender dynamics; work on agricultural value chains, technologies and policies that have a potential to empower women; and measure changes in women’s empowerment.

Social Inclusion Frameworks and Methods

Social inclusion as used in this review includes ethnic minorities, people with disabilities and adolescents and young adults (male and female) and gender based violence. Social inclusion definitions are often context specific. For example the Asia Foundation defines social inclusion as [six disadvantaged groups in Indonesia](#): vulnerable children and youth, remote indigenous communities reliant on natural resources, discriminated religious minorities, victims of gross human rights violations, *waria* (transgender women), and people with disabilities.

Unlike gender inclusion and women’s economic empowerment with a multitude of frameworks and pathways, social inclusion as found in the subject review deals more extensively with definitions and policy development as published by the United Nations and its agencies the UNDP and UNESCO.

The World Bank’s [“Inclusion Matters : The Foundation for Shared Prosperity”](#) (2013) does offer a framework to assist practitioners in asking, outlining, and developing some of the right questions that can help advance the agenda of inclusion in different contexts.

Focus on South-East Asia

The Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFATD), offers three useful reports relating to market systems development and gender and social inclusion that are particular to South-East Asia. [“Achieving Changes in Markets: The MDF Framework for Defining and Populating Pathways for Systemic Change”](#) The MDF is using its systemic change framework in the five countries where it operates: Fiji, Timor-Leste, Pakistan, Sri Lanka and Papua New Guinea. The first step in applying the Framework is to develop *an inclusive*, pro-poor growth strategy for each sector.

Viet Nam is the focus of [DFATD’s Aus4Equality Programme](#). Aus4Equality which runs from 2017-2022 aims to empower local women to better engage in agriculture and tourism businesses, enhance women’s voices in decision-making and leadership, support business partnerships with the private sector, and support government policies and services that enable more inclusive development.

DFATD's ["Investing in Women Initiative Literature Review"](#) 2015, provides approaches, perspectives and models as well as barriers to development and the International Finance Corporation's ranking of seven South Asia countries in the ease of doing business and provides a rationale for DFATD's investing in women initiative.

Value Chains

The three references with a focus on value chains and gender and social inclusion range from a 2017 article on ["Value chain development with the extremely poor: evidence and lessons from CARE, Save the Children, and World Vision"](#) to an early (2009) but still practical guide ["Promoting Gender Equitable Opportunities in Agricultural Value Chains: A Handbook"](#) to the DFATD [Cambodia Agricultural Value Chain Program \(CAVAC\)](#) evaluation for Phase One. Phase Two begun in 2017 aims for more gender-sensitive programme design.

Annotated Bibliography:

I. Global Gender and WEE Frameworks:

1. [Donor Committee for Enterprise Development \(DCED\), "Synthesis Document: How to Integrate Gender and Women's Economic Empowerment into Private Sector Development Programmes,"](#) May 2017 and revised in 2018.

This synthesis document provides guidance on integrating gender and WEE in the project cycle of private sector development programmes, the degree of WEE focus (basic and intermediate/advance), and covers design, implementation and results measurement. This paper seeks to provide Private Sector Development programmes aspiring to 'do more on WEE' but struggling to know where to start, 'step up' the gender-responsiveness of their programme by providing: 1. Concise, practical guidance on how to incorporate WEE into programme delivery and MRM systems. 2. Links to the best proven and practical tools and resources available; and 3. Real programme examples and case studies.

2. [Jones, L. \(2016\) Women's Empowerment and Market Systems: Concepts, practical guidance and tools \(WEAMS Framework.\)](#)The BEAM Exchange, accessed from <https://www.beamexchange.org>. © 2016 The BEAM Exchange.

This report authored by Linda Jones and commissioned by the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) is an update of the 2012 Discussion Paper for Making Markets Work for the Poor Women's Economic Empowerment Framework¹ (the M4P WEE Framework) and is intended for practitioners, donors, policy makers and other stakeholders. The update includes Chapter One: Women's Empowerment and Market Systems Concepts that examines and updates the conceptual aspects of a women's empowerment and market systems framework, supported by recent experiences in the field. Chapter Two: Practical Step-by-Step Guidance for a WEAMS Framework offers practical guidance on women's empowerment in market systems, using a revised life cycle approach, illustrated by mini-cases and supplemented by links to other resources. Chapter Three WEAMS TOOLS includes a suite of tools implemented by various donors and partners that have been applied in market systems programmes so that their experiences can benefit the wider market systems community. Beyond the five non-negotiable dimensions of WEE in the guide, various dimensions of WEE are presented along with examples of how these can be customized depending upon the programme content. The Market Development Facility (MDF) in Asia-Pacific is included in this guide as an example of the need for

contextualization during the research process regarding the types of employment women undertake (p. 20).

3. [Erin Markel, “Measuring Economic Empowerment in Private Sector Development-Guidelines for Practitioners”](#) prepared for DCED, July 2014.

Recommended by the DCED Synthesis Document cited above, as a resource for establishing a WEE Framework, it begins with the need for articulating WEE within results chains and the benefits of measuring household dynamics as the one key place where women and men live and experience the various effects – positive and sometimes negative – of development and empowerment. The guide also aims to provide practical advice to practitioners seeking to measure women’s economic empowerment (WEE) in PSD programming and documenting how to make each aspect of results measurement more gender-responsive.

4. The Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) [Operational Guidance Note on Gender Equality and Women’s Economic Empowerment in Agriculture](#) (2015).

The Operation Guidance Note is intended for DFTA Activity Managers DFAT activity managers to enable them to integrate gender equality concerns into analysis that is commissioned or commission specific gender analysis as needed for the agriculture sector and to ensure that DFAT’s agriculture investments: 1. do no harm to women and gender dynamics; 2. work on agricultural value chains, technologies and policies that have a potential to empower women; and 3. measure changes in women’s empowerment. It also complements and assumes knowledge of the [Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment Strategy](#), February 2016 and [Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment in DFAT’s Aid Program Good Practice Note](#), October 2016.

5. [Hakemulder, R. and E. Miller, Coffey International, “Mainstreaming Women’s Economic Empowerment in Market Systems Development—Practitioner Guidelines,”](#) April 2013

This practitioner’s guide developed for the M4P Hub and funded by SIDA and DFID may offer useful questions and considerations presented in user friendly table format that M4P programmes can address along the project cycle in order to be most inclusive of WEE and social inclusion priorities.

6. [ODI, Social Development Direct and UK AID, “Review of Evaluation Approaches and Methods used by Interventions of Women’s and Girls’ Economic Empowerment,”](#) March 2014.

Recommended by the DCED Synthesis Document cited above, offers guidance on developing a WEE Theory of Change with a range of examples in Annex 9. The Review found a gap in knowledge around the economic empowerment of adolescent girls. The authors assert that it is essential to undertake a robust context and gender analysis and to have a Theory of Change to guide the evaluation which builds on a holistic approach to Women and Girls’ Economic Empowerment.

7. [Thorpe, J, \(June 2017\) “Market systems approaches and ‘leaving no one behind’” as published by the BEAM Exchange as a Featured Resource.](#)

The paper starts by exploring who the extremely marginalised are, what we know about how they engage in markets, and the potential for market-based approaches to be more inclusive. It then

presents the experiences from GRAD, PRIME and Samriddhi projects, and draws lessons from these experiences and those of other practitioners for reaching highly marginalised people through a market systems approach. The paper addresses entry points to overcome economic exclusion and interventions that reach very marginalised groups that would be helpful in project design. Implementation and monitoring evaluation related to extremely marginalized groups are addressed through lessons learned from the three projects.

8. [Thorpe J. , M.Maestre and T. Kidder, “Market Systems Approaches to Enabling Women’s Economic Empowerment Through Addressing Unpaid Care Work, Conceptual Framework,”](#) March 2016 as commissioned by the BEAM Exchange.

This framing document sets out how the provision of care can be integrated conceptually within a market systems approach – as tested through field work and exchange with programmes and practitioners – when baseline research and analysis determine that care provision is a critical issue affecting how programmes benefit women and men. It explores the use of market systems approaches to design interventions that employ ‘systems thinking’ and techniques of facilitation to deliver sustainable, scalable, system-wide solutions. Unpaid care work is a significant and regularly overlooked factor which affects women’s economic, political and social activities.

9. Markel, Erin et. al., (2015) prepared for United States Agency for International Development’s Leveraging Economic Opportunities project, [“Making the Business Case: Women’s Economic Empowerment in Market Systems Development” Report #11](#)

This report is based on extensive research and interviews and provides the rationale that market systems facilitation practitioners can use to engage private sector firms in efforts to empower women. From identifying partners to articulating the mutually beneficial value of women’s inclusion, the paper offers guidance and real-world examples to help companies empower women working at every level of the economy. It includes strategies to increase the bottom line for a wide spectrum of businesses, from multinational corporations to medium-sized firms and microenterprises in developing countries. The report remains pertinent due to the ongoing demand of private sector partners for a convincing gender inclusive business case as a primary stakeholder in market development initiatives.

10. [Mennonite Economic Development Associates \(MEDA\), The GEM Framework: Gender Equality Mainstreaming for Business Growth and Impact, USAID, 2018](#)

The Gender Equality Mainstreaming (GEM) Framework is an approach that is presented as a how-to manual – a practical guide and toolkit – for assessing gender equality, and identifying, implementing and measuring gender equality mainstreaming strategies within companies. The framework builds upon the environmental, social and governance (ESG) investment standard by mainstreaming gender across a range of ESG criteria. Designed for investors and capacity builders, the ultimate aim of the framework is to transform companies to be more gender equitable while supporting business growth and impact. This resource brings gender to the front end of analyzing business operations, both the opportunities and the risks.

II. Social Inclusion

11. [UNESCO, University of Melbourne, Trinity College Dublin, MOST2, "Policies and Processes for Social Inclusion, Vol. 1, Possibilities from South-East Asia," September 2014](#)

This report, based on a seminar, aims to contribute to the debate about inclusive social policies in South-East Asia and presents five keys to inclusive policy. It provides a summary of some of the presentations at the seminar and a summary of some of the social programmes and priorities of the participating countries. The report also identifies a platform to promote social inclusion and recommendations to improve evidence based social policies. Lessons learned are presented in Section 1.2.

12. ["World Bank. 2011. "Poverty and Social Exclusion in India". Washington, DC. © World Bank. License: CC BY 3.0 IGO.](#)

The objective is to provide a diagnostic of how the three excluded groups under analysis have fared along various development indicators during a period of rapid economic growth in the national economy. The report is organized around three chapters, in addition to this overview, each one dealing with an excluded group: Scheduled Tribe (ST), Scheduled Caste (SC), and women.

13. [World Bank. 2013. "Inclusion Matters : The Foundation for Shared Prosperity". Washington, DC. © World Bank. License: CC BY 3.0 IGO."](#)

This report tries to put boundaries around the abstraction that is "social inclusion." Placing the discussion of social inclusion within global transitions and transformations, the report argues that social inclusion is an evolving agenda. It offers two easy-to-use definitions and a framework to assist practitioners in asking, outlining, and developing some of the right questions that can help advance the agenda of inclusion in different contexts. This report builds on previous analytical work, especially by the World Bank, on themes that touch upon social inclusion, including multidimensional poverty, inequality, equity, social cohesion, and empowerment.

14. [UNDP, "Marginalized Minorities in Development Programming—A UNDP Resource Guide and Toolkit", 2010.](#)

The Guide is primarily intended for UNDP country office practitioners and those with policy advisory responsibilities, but it may also serve as a reference document for other UN agencies, multilateral organizations, government counterparts and institutions, and civil society organizations. The main objectives of the Guide and the Toolkit are to: Introduce and enhance understanding of the key issues and rights of minorities; Identify institutions and mechanisms at international, regional and national levels for the promotion and protection of minority rights; Raise awareness of the importance of addressing minority issues in development programming and to provide guidance in the application of relevant normative frameworks in programme/ project planning, designing, implementation and evaluation; and Facilitate capacity development and identify strategies for strengthening partnerships

with government counterparts, the donor community and civil society organizations (CSOs). It includes addressing caste discrimination in development as well as targeted or inclusive approaches.

15. [UNICEF, “ 2014 Annual Results Report Social Inclusion”](#)

Social inclusion is a new outcome area in UNICEF’s Strategic Plan for 2014–2017 and is developed around five social inclusion programme areas: child poverty and social protection; human rights, non-discrimination and participation; public finance for children; governance and decentralization efforts; and social inclusion in humanitarian settings.

16. [UN Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific, , “Building Disability-Inclusive Societies in Asia and the Pacific-Assessing Progress of the Incheon Strategy,” 2018](#)

The Incheon Strategy to “Make the Right Real” for Persons with Disabilities in Asia and the Pacific guides the third Decade activities with 10 interrelated development goals, 27 aligned targets and 62 corresponding indicators. The Incheon Strategy goals and targets are presented as well as goals which cover poverty reduction, employment generation, political participation, ensuring accessibility in comprehensive terms, social protection, early intervention, education and disability-inclusive disaster risk reduction. The 22 annexes present data and country specific statistics on indicators around disability in Asia and the Pacific.

III. Focus on South-East Asia

17. The Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade [“Achieving Changes in Markets: The MDF Framework for Defining and Populating Pathways for Systemic Change” Strategic Guidance Note 3, V 1, August 2015](#), prepared by Cardno.

This report is a foundational piece for understanding systemic change in market development that is inclusive and sustainable with change that is ultimately owned and managed by local actors. In March 2014, the Donor Committee for Enterprise Development (DCED) convened a workshop of experienced practitioners to discuss systemic change, and in particular, how to assess progress in bringing it about. One of the key recommendations emerging from the workshop was that a program should outline a ‘pathway’ that describes what systemic changes it expects to happen and how the program will influence those changes. *The Market Development Facility (MDF) is using its systemic change framework in the five countries where it operates: Fiji, Timor-Leste, Pakistan, Sri Lanka and Papua New Guinea.*

18. [The Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, “Gender-Responsive Equitable Agriculture and Tourism \(GREAT\) Investment Design Document Final, August 2016](#)

This design document outlines the Gender-Responsive Equitable Agriculture and Tourism (GREAT) programme, which was renamed *Aus4Equality*, will run from 2017 - 2022. Practitioners may especially benefit from Annex 5 Gender Equality, Ethnicity and Women’s Economic Empowerment, an analysis highlighting key data and issues related to women’s empowerment and ethnic minority development in Vietnam to guide the GREAT design. The analysis is divided into three parts: Part 1 provides an

overview of data and debates relating to women's empowerment and ethnic minority development in Vietnam; Part 2 uses a women's economic empowerment framework designed for market systems development, to analyse women's social and economic status in rural, north-west of Vietnam (as data allows); and Part 3 highlights the implications of this analysis for the GREAT design. [Fast Facts on Aus4equality](#) provides a summary of expected outcomes and activities.

19. The Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade ["Investing in Women Initiative Literature Review" February 2015](#)

The Investing in Women Initiative was launched to bridge the gap for women's small and medium enterprises to grow and take advantage of global investment opportunities and contribute to the growing body of knowledge and evidence that provides a launching pad for continued policy reform and action on women's economic empowerment. This literature review brings together a body of knowledge in the field of Women's Economic Empowerment, and draws from academia, think tanks, multi-lateral organisations, NGOs, and corporations. Relevant evidence is presented, gaps in evidence are identified, approaches, perspectives and models are canvassed, and statistics are presented. Barriers to development and ranking of seven South Asia countries are presented and briefly analyzed.

IV. Value Chains

20. [Norrell, D. et. al. "Value chain development with the extremely poor: evidence and lessons from CARE, Save the Children, and World Vision" Enterprise Development and Microfinance Vol. 28, 2017.](#)

Keywords: value chain development, extreme poor, smallholders, market systems development. In this article, the authors discuss how VCD can be applied with the extremely poor and how five levers of change can improve livelihoods: 1) capacity; 2) access; 3) productivity; 4) household influence; and 5) enabling environment. The authors describe examples of how market-based approaches can be utilized effectively to enhance food security. Although they may be distinctive at points, the authors highlight the complementary approaches and outcomes utilized by CARE, Save the Children, and World Vision in facilitating VCD. Programming recommendations are presented in the conclusions.

21. The Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade [Cambodia Agricultural Value Chain Program \(CAVAC\) Phase 1 Completion Evaluation, Australian Government, Canberra, December 2017.](#)

CAVAC Phase one targeted its agribusiness interventions based on 'typology studies' of women's and men's agricultural roles and to increase agricultural productivity– not to transform gender roles or promote women's empowerment. CAVAC typology studies had revealed that women did not like to travel far from home to buy products. CAVAC Phase two's Women's Economic Empowerment and Gender Strategy (January 2017) provides more detailed guidance for gender-sensitive programming than CAVAC's 2010 strategy including agribusiness interventions that work within female-dominated parts of the value chain for depth of impact for women and focusing only on mainstreaming women's economic empowerment (pp. 53-54). In short the goal of gender equality in activities and outcomes is elevated in Phase 2 as well as placing the gender strategy as a contractual milestone.

22. [Rubin, D., C. Manfre and K. Barrett, "Promoting Gender Equitable Opportunities in Agricultural Value Chains: A Handbook", prepared for the USAID GATE Project, 2009.](#)

This 2009 Guide remains relevant for developing a gender analysis that links gender relations and roles into both horizontal and vertical value chain operations and on-farm productivity. The Guide is organized by Ph.1 mapping gender roles and relations; Ph. 2. Gender inequalities to gender based constraints; Ph. 3. Assessing the consequences of these constraints; Ph. 4. Actions to remove constraints; and Ph. 5 measuring the success of actions.

V. Toolkits

23. Angelica Senders et. al., [“Gender in Value Chains: A practical toolkit to integrate a gender perspective in agricultural value chain development”](#) 2014.

This toolkit intends to motivate and help practitioners in integrating a gender perspective in agricultural value chain development, by providing practical tools for all stages of the value chain intervention. The toolkit provides an overview of material available on gender and value chains. The tools are selected from manuals produced by USAID, SNV, GIZ, ILO, CARE and other organizations in the Agri-ProFocus Gender in Value Chains Network. There are three types of tools presented: 1. Tools that support data collection and research to gain insight into gender constraints and opportunities within certain value chains. 2. Tools guiding the facilitation of participatory processes in order to involve male and female value chain actors in the different stages of the project. 3. Tools describing an approach, a way of working, combining a variety of interventions. It is up to the practitioner to decide which combination of tools to use and to adjust the tools to his or her programme and geographical context.

24. Napier, Mark, et. al., [“Promoting Women’s Financial Inclusion: A Toolkit”](#) 2013, for UK Aid and GIZ.

This toolkit offers a practical guide to developing and monitoring financial services to enhance women’s financial inclusion as one tool for the economic empowerment of women. A financial inclusion programme may not be targeted specifically at women. For example, it may have broad poverty reduction goals that benefit men as well as women. To make sure women benefit as much as possible from the programme, it is important to understand why financial exclusion for women is different from financial exclusion for men. It includes tools for scoping the issues, project design, implementation and M&E. The Toolkit provides examples from around the world.

25. [Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency \(Sida\), “Tool: Integrating Women’s Economic Empowerment into M4P Approaches”, February 2013](#)

The four page tool brief advocates the setting of a strategic framework for WEE and social inclusion at the planning phase of a project and offers questions and guidance. Sida lays out how to find out about market functions; rules, policies and practices; constraints and opportunities that are sought out in research and gender analysis of existing market systems are critical to ensuring integration of WEE in M4P and to making rationale and effective planning decisions. “Key Success Factors” summarizes the key methods and approaches recommended and that can be applied in any geographic context.

26. Miehlbradt, A. and Linda Jones, [“Market Research for Value Chain Initiatives—Information to Action—A Toolkit Series for Market Development Practitioners”](#) Mennonite Economic Development Associates, 2007.

A practical step by step guide for market research in a value chain analysis beginning with getting ready, key information sources, understanding, choosing and sequencing market research tools, introduction to action research, and market research in a programme life cycle.

[Schulte, J., S. Williams, D. Rapic, and P. Morris of Development and Training Services, "Toolkit for Integrating GBV Prevention and Response into Economic Growth Projects," USAID, 2014.](#) The Toolkit covers four overarching themes: 1. How and why economic growth projects can play a critical role in addressing GBV; 2. How GBV can affect and undermine the outcomes of economic growth projects; 3. Different contexts to consider when integrating GBV prevention and response into economic growth projects; and 4. Practical ideas and strategies for integrating GBV prevention and response into economic growth projects.